# IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA CHARLOTTE DIVISION

DAVID DUVALL,	
Plaintiff,	
v.	Civil Action No. 3:19-cv-624-DSC
NOVANT HEALTH, INC.,	
Defendant.	) ) )

### DEFENDANT NOVANT HEALTH, INC.'S MOTION FOR SANCTIONS

COMES NOW Defendant Novant Health, Inc. ("Novant Health"), by and through its counsel, and respectfully files this Motion for Sanctions and requests the Court to issue sanctions against Plaintiff and Plaintiff's counsel pursuant to its inherent authority to sanction parties and counsel for certain bad faith conduct.

- 1. Under controlling Supreme Court and Fourth Circuit precedent, a court may exercise its inherent power to sanction when a party or counsel willfully disobeys a court order or when a party acts in bad faith, vexatiously, wantonly, or for oppressive reasons. *See Chambers v. NASCO, Inc.*, 501 U.S. 32, 44-46, 111 S. Ct. 2123, 2126 (1991) and *Strag v. Bd. of Trustees, Craven Cmty. Coll.*, 55 F.3d 943, 955 (4th Cir. 1995).
- 2. Plaintiff and Plaintiff's counsel displayed a pattern of misconduct throughout the trial that warrants the imposition of sanctions, including (1) deliberately referencing improper comparator evidence to support an unfounded "pattern" of discrimination, in direct violation of the Court's orders; (2) telling the jury "round one for punitive damages" was that Novant Health had a witness fired to prevent him from testifying for Plaintiff, despite receiving three sworn declarations uniformly confirming the witness was terminated as part of a position elimination

and the decision makers did not even know he was testifying; and (3) repeatedly referencing "diversity bonuses," "targets" and "quotas" when arguing Plaintiff was improperly terminated to further diversity initiatives where the uncontroverted evidence established that no such bonuses, targets or quotas even existed during Plaintiff's employment.

3. Plaintiff and Plaintiff's counsel's misconduct, which is further described in Novant Health's Memorandum in Support of this Motion, presents a textbook example of when sanctions pursuant to the Court's inherent authority are both warranted and necessary to protect the integrity of the judicial process and to deter similar inappropriate conduct in the future.

For the reasons set forth above, and those set forth in Novant Health's Memorandum in Support of this Motion, Novant Health respectfully requests that the Court grant its Motion for Sanctions and issue such sanctions as it deems appropriate, including dismissal of this action with prejudice, an award of attorneys' fees to Novant Health for bringing this motion, and/or such other relief the Court deems just and proper. Novant Health further request that the Court schedule oral argument on this Motion.

(Signature block appears on the next page.)

### s/ Benjamin R. Holland

Benjamin R. Holland N.C. Bar No. 28580 ben.holland@ogletree.com Margaret Santen N.C. Bar No. 52947 maggie.santen@ogletree.com Elizabeth R. Gift N.C. Bar No. 44331 elizabeth.gift@ogletree.com S. Abigail Littrell N.C. Bar No. 49354 abby.littrell@ogletree.com

## OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.

201 South College Street, Suite 2300 Charlotte, North Carolina 28244 Telephone: 704.342.2588 Facsimile: 704.342.4379

#### and

Charles E. Johnson
N.C. Bar No. 9890
cejohnson@robinsonbradshaw.com
Stephen M. Cox
N.C. Bar No. 23057
scox@robinsonbradshaw.com
Angelique R. Vincent-Hamacher
N.C. Bar No. 29547
avincent@robinsonbradshaw.com

### ROBINSON, BRADSHAW & HINSON, P.A.

101 North Tryon Street, Suite 1900 Charlotte, North Carolina 28246 Telephone: 704.377.2536

Telephone: 704.377.2536 Facsimile: 704.373.3996

Attorneys for Defendant Novant Health, Inc.

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I, Benjamin R. Holland, hereby certify that I have this day electronically filed the foregoing **DEFENDANT NOVANT HEALTH, INC.'S MOTION FOR SANCTIONS** with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of the filing to the following person:

S. Luke Largess
Attorney for Plaintiff
Tin, Fulton, Walker & Owen, PLLC
301 East Park Avenue
Charlotte, NC 28203
Telephone: 704.338.1220

Facsimile: 704.338.1312

Email: llargess@tinfulton.com

Dated this 1st day of February, 2022.

s/ Benjamin R. Holland

Benjamin R. Holland, N.C. Bar No. 28580

Attorney for Defendant

OGLETREE, DEAKINS, NASH, SMOAK & STEWART, P.C.
201 South College Street, Suite 2300

Charlotte, NC 28244

Telephone: 704-342-2588 Facsimile: 704-342-4379

Email: ben.holland@ogletree.com